

30 July 2025

Prof. Andreas Honecker
Editor-in-Charge
SciPost Physics

re: *ms* # 202504_00035v3:

“Muonium reaction in MgO: A showcase for the final steps of ion implantation”

by Rui C. Vilão, Ali Roonkiani, Apostolos G. Marinopoulos, Helena V. Alberto, João M. Gil, Ricardo B.L. Vieira, Robert Scheuermann and Alois Weidinger

Dear Prof. Honecker,

I won't bother to repeat my previous comments in detail, since the changes in the present version (welcome as they may be) are mostly superficial. The authors have chosen to ignore my questions about the energetics of polaron formation and the time scale of lattice relaxation, and once again completely ignored the evidence provided by applications of electric field on the ionization track of the muon. I'm sure this will not change easily.

Despite my reservations, and in the spirit of “giving them enough rope to hang themselves in public”, I still recommend publishing this substantial work. It is, of course, the responsibility of the Editor to decide whether to invest the journal's reputation in this exercise.

Sincerely,

Prof. Emeritus Jess H. Brewer
DEPT. OF PHYSICS & ASTRONOMY
UNIV. OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
VANCOUVER, BC, CANADA V6T 1Z1